

CONCEPTUALIZING CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE IN ORGANIC FOOD PURCHASE USING COGNITIVE-AFFECTIVE-BEHAVIOUR MODEL

Harniyati Hussin¹, Nabsiah Abdul Wahid^{1,*}

¹Graduate School of Business, Universiti Sains Malaysia, 11800 USM Penang, Malaysia.

ABSTRACT – Researchers have shifted their focus to investigating the cognitive, emotional, and behavioural elements of the customer's consumption experience following the application of a customer-centric approach by businesses in their operations. This review paper attempts to conceptualize the role of customer experiences (CE) of retail organic foods using the lens of the Cognitive-Affective-Behaviour (C-A-B) theory. C-A-B is chosen as it is a widely used theory to explain an individual's comprehensive evaluation of an object, which represents their personal cognitive, emotional, and behavioural responses. Particularly, the C-A-B model reflects the direct effect that cognition has on emotional responses, which then drives collective behaviour, which in turn works as the motivation for a person to participate in a certain behaviour. From the review, CE is suggested to show positive and negative influences respectively on green experiential satisfaction and retail organic food repurchase intention. The links suggested amongst the variables would help to extend the cognition-affection-behavioural framework to the green retail contexts by testing a novel relationship of understanding consumers' green behaviour. The findings may also demonstrate the importance of promoting sustainable store strategies that create favourable customer experiences of themselves. It is also expected that this insight will help to improve, both practically and theoretically, the customer experience measurement tools used in the green retail service industry, as well as to broaden and deepen our understanding of The Theory of Cognitive-Affective-Behaviour (CAB).

ARTICLE HISTORY

Received: 10-9-2023

Revised: 28-9-2023

Accepted: 2-10-2023

KEYWORDS

Cognitive-Affective-Behaviour
Customer Experience
Organic Foods
Retail
Malaysia

INTRODUCTION

Malaysia is one of the nations in the Asia-Pacific region with excellent potential for the development of organic food (Nathan et al., 2021). With the country's organic product consumption demand estimated at more than RM20 million per year with a growth rate of at least 12.4% annually (Cheng et al., 2020; Suhaimie, Ibrahim & Abd Wahab, 2016), it has become one of the primary drivers of Malaysia's economic growth in the service sector (Salmuni et al., 2020). While the Department of Agriculture Malaysia (DOAM) (2019) reported that people's acceptance of organic food products is increasing dramatically, the COVID-19 outbreak starting end of 2019 has severely affected the marketplace environment including retail outlets. Although the government's preventative steps (lockdowns, confinement orders, movement restrictions, social distancing) were implemented to slow down the spread of COVID-19, these, unfortunately, have directly impacted the supply, demand, and day-to-day operations of the Malaysian retail sector (Jaafar, 2021), including organic foods. The 'new normal life culture has changed many consumer preferences, behaviors, and retailers' practices during the pandemic (e.g., online shopping). As retailing is all about having a total customer experience (Bascur & Rusu, 2020; Berry et al., 2002), it is quite reasonable to think that the success of resuming retail outlet operations lies in the retailers' ability to provide top-notch customers' retail outlet shopping experiences in the post-pandemic era. The challenge for retailers however is that today's customers have a broader understanding of a company's offerings including those of its rivals and pricing structures. As they value novelty, they highly expect to get memorable experiences through the company's delivered systems, products, and services (Bascur & Rusu, 2020).

The customer experience (CE) in the retail environment context is the result of interaction between a subject (the customer) and an object (the experience provider), and the act of co-creation between the two (Garg et al., 2014). In the context of organic food that is sold in retail outlets, customer experience (CE) takes place whenever a consumer interacts with products (experience with organic foods) or the physical environment of the store and the employees, policies, and procedures of the retailer (retail outlet shopping experience). Moreover, CE takes place when the consumer consumes and uses the product (consumption experience of organic foods). In short, customers are impacted by all aspects of a retail store, from the product selection process to everything that occurs after the purchase involving the customers (Chatzoglou et al., 2022; Terblanche, 2018; Mouri et al., 2015; Yang et al., 2012). This may be why Lemon and Verhoef's (2016) definition of CE it is a multidimensional construct focusing on a customer's cognitive, emotional, behavioral, sensorial, and social responses to a firm's offerings during the customer's entire purchase journey, for instance, is found to be based on a synthesis of CE's components and its related stages.

This review paper attempts to conceptualize the role played by customer experiences (CE) in retail organic food settings using the lens of the Cognitive-Affective-Behaviour (C-A-B) theory. The C-A-B theory is selected because it is commonly used to describe how a person's thoughts (cognitive), feelings (emotional/affective), and actions (behavioral) relate to their overall assessment of an object. Specifically, the C-A-B theory captures the direct effect of cognition on affective reaction, which in turn influences collective behavior that will stimulate an individual's motivation to engage in certain behavior. The review would help reveal whether how CE can be applied both in the cognitive and affective components of CAB that will result in the consumer being able to rationalize and/or to be emotionally affected which can influence them to behave in a certain way (e.g., to purchase retail organic foods) within a retail shopping context.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Conceptualization of Customer Experience

The term 'experience' was used by Hirschman and Holbrook (1982) to describe the facet of consumer behavior that makes use of multiple senses, imagination, and emotional expression during the consumption of a product. This concept was developed further in the early 1980s by scholars who centered their attention on the experiential aspects of deals rather than their purely rational or cognitive components (Holbrook & Hirschman, 1982). Researchers' interest in CE persisted throughout the 1990s. According to Schmitt (1999), experiences have reason and purpose, are induced rather than self-generated, and are brought on by certain stimuli. Hence, experiences are states that form in response to the existence of a stimulus, as opposed to evaluations or emotional states that an individual is now going through (Brakus et al., 2009). Schmitt (1999) added that encountering, experiencing, or living through things that impart value on a person's sensory, emotional, cognitive, behavioral, and relational domains is what leads to the formation of experiences. The aforementioned experience is characterized by its uniqueness as it pertains alone to the person. It requires active engagement across several dimensions, including intellectual, emotional, sensory, physical, and spiritual aspects. This observation is supported by Jain et al. (2017), who emphasize the customer's role in this multifaceted process. Poulsson and Kale (2004) suggest that individuals have the potential to acquire experience via their exposure to certain stimuli. According to Goode et al. (2010), an experience encompasses the cognitive processes, emotional responses, behavioral manifestations, and subjective assessments that arise in connection with or in reaction to stimuli. Poulsson and Kale (2004) observed that these states exhibit a strong interconnection and mutually reinforce each other throughout the duration of the event.

Clearly, these theoretical ideas suggest that experience in a retail context may be seen as the results of the interaction between a subject (the customer) and an object (the business that provides the experience) and from the two of them working together to create the experience (Bustamante & Rubio, 2017). It encompasses the interactions of customers with products (their experiences with the products), as well as the physical surroundings of the retailer, as well as the employees, rules, and procedures of the retailer (in-store retail shopping experience). The customer's emotional, social, cognitive, affective, and physical reactions to the business are therefore represented by CE, which has been viewed as a multidimensional construct in the retail setting (Verhoef et al., 2009; Brakus et al., 2009). According to Schmitt (2010), the term "customer experience" encompasses all interactions related to the acquisition of a product or service. This includes the entirety of a customer's purchasing experience, as highlighted by Lemon and Verhoef (2016), which represents the direct or indirect engagement between the customer and a collective of market participants, as noted by Keiningham et al. (2017). Similar to Lemon and Verhoef (2016), Homburg et al. (2015: p. 8) define CE as "the evolution of a person's sensorial, affective, cognitive, relational, and behavioral responses to a brand by traversing a journey of touchpoints along pre-purchase, purchase, and post-purchase (phases) and continuously judging this journey against response thresholds of co-occurring experiences". Mowen and Minor (2002) argued consumers' experiences are shaped by the customers' knowledge together with emotions when utilizing products or services. Customers' emotional responses to the personal events they experience will be significantly influenced by the goods or services they purchase (Grundey, 2008). In the restaurant context, for example, experience quality refers to the experience of a customer or observation of features of the restaurant received during the course of the dining process (Jeong and Jang, 2011).

CE includes the entirety of the purchase process (Hollebeek and Rather, 2019). According to the theory put forth by Woodward and Holbrook (2013), "all experiences are consuming experiences." They are typically thought to be interacting occurrences that result in a person's experience of either pleasure or displeasure. Verhoef et al. (2009) contend that a client's experience can be either positive (enjoyable) or negative (unenjoyable), leading to either positive or negative responses from the consumer regarding satisfaction, value, quality, image, purchase intentions, patronage, loyalty, and recommendations. Likewise, theorizing experiences as different from products or services, Pine and Gilmore (1998: p. 3) said that consumers buy experiences to "spend time enjoying a succession of memorable events that a corporation creates... to engage him in an intrinsically personal way." In line with Abbott (1955: p. 40), the basic premise is "what people really desire is not products but satisfying experiences". According to Kusumawati and Rahayu (2020a), the long-term success of a retail firm is contingent upon the positive experiences of its consumers. Customers are more likely to have a favorable experience when their expectations about the product or service are met. The acquisition of experiential features via consuming is often seen as crucial for conceptualizing the encountered values (Sweeney and Soutar, 2001). Therefore, this study discovered that CE is a multi-dimensional model that captures the customer's cognitive, emotional, behavioral, and sensory responses throughout the entirety of their purchasing experience (Lemon and Verhoef, 2016; Brakus et al., 2009).

As the customer experience (CE) idea has gained prominence in recent years, many researchers develop a model, indicator, scale, or tools to measure CE in the service delivery context (Salmuni et al., 2020). For instance, the customers' perceptions of a company's service quality have been quantified with the use of a metric called the Customer Experience Index (CEI). A number of different models were developed, such as SERVQUAL (Parasuraman, Zeithaml & Berry, 1985; Parasuraman, Zeithaml & Berry, 1988; Parasuraman, Zeithaml & Berry, 1991), SERPERF (Cronin & Taylor, 1992), the Gronroos Model (Gronroos, 1984), and most recently, the Customer Experience Quality (EXQ) (Khasif et al., 2016) which has been used to measure the customer experiences in service delivery. These models have proposed both tangible and intangible service attributes as a measurement construct to service delivery systems. In a manner comparable to that of the healthcare sector, which has implemented a diverse range of CE measuring tools including The Net Promoter Score, often known as NPS, which is the metric that is applied most frequently in hospital systems and the National Health Service (NHS) to evaluate the degree to which patients are satisfied with regard to healthcare services (Salmuni et al., 2020).

Customer Experience in Cognitive Situations

Many scholars contended that cognition is the earliest stage of the CE, coming before emotional (affective) responses because cognition primarily processes newly acquired knowledge (Bustamante & Rubio, 2017; Da Silva & Syed, 2006; Kempf, 1999). Numerous academic research highlights the fact that subjective reactions develop later, and functional appraisal of the product or service happens first in cognitive thinking (Bagozzi et al., 1999; Garbarino & Edell, 1997; Lazarus, 1982). According to Garbarino and Edell (1997), the customer's interaction with the product yields information that influences how perceptions, expectations, and demand for the product as a whole are formed. Nevertheless, according to The American Psychological Association (2016), cognitive processes which is considered as a higher mental process include perception, memory, language, problem-solving, and abstract thought.

Several academic studies demonstrate that in cognitive thinking, functional rather than subjective evaluation of the product or service occurs first (Bagozzi et al., 1999; Garbarino & Edell, 1997; Lazarus, 1982). The way the client interacts with the product produces information that affects how perceptions, expectations, and demand for the product as a whole are created (Garbarino and Edell, 1997). Nevertheless, vision, memory, language, problem-solving, and abstract reasoning are among the cognitive processes that are taken into account by higher mental processes, according to The American Psychological Association (2016). Hence, cognitive experience involves more than merely learning new facts (classifying, analyzing, and reasoning). Instead, it results from consumers' own mental responses to external stimuli, which are what inspire them to engage in creative interactions with businesses and brands (Schmitt, 1999a). Many elements make up these mental reactions, which include joyful ideas, memories, or thoughts. As a result, marketing attempts to appeal to target customers via the use of surprise create interest, and provocation (Schmitt, 1999a; Brakus et al., 2009). The idea is to get customers to think creatively about the information they are exposed to when they are buying or consuming something (Schmitt, 1999; Gentile et al., 2007). The capacity of customers to establish connections and completely comprehend ideas when they are in a position to buy or consume, according to McCrae (1987), is improved by creative thinking.

Clearly, this viewpoint holds that mechanisms that convert a person's interactions into ideas or thoughts are what lead to cognition. These thoughts encompass products or services encountered, the servicescape, in-store communication, and so forth. Employing a variety of stimuli to provide consumers with a comprehensive cognitive experience, managers strive to arouse the customers' ideas through these activities. Consequently, the cognitive component of marketing stimuli is their ability to stimulate thought, curiosity, innovation, etc. This mental activity can be induced by cognition or by combining the consumer's experience of the item with information from other sources to provide uniqueness, usefulness, and/or knowledge for the customers.

Customer Experience in Affective Situations

The relationship between emotions and experiences has been demonstrated by experiential theorists since the 1980s (Holbrook & Hirschman 1982). The first examination of consumer emotions drew from psychological research, whereby scholars recognized the intricate nature of emotions and attempted to address intrinsic challenges in perceiving, evaluating, and distinguishing emotional conditions (Izard, 1977; Plutchik, 1980). The importance of how consumers feel during CE is highlighted in a more recent study (De Keyser et al. 2015; Verhoef et al. 2009), which is also known as an emotional reaction (Baxendale, Macdonald, and Wilson 2015; Verhoef et al. 2009) or distinct emotions (De Keyser et al. 2015). The phrase "emotional (affective) reaction" describes how customers feel as a result of their interactions with businesses (Shaver et al. 1987; Verhoef et al. 2009).

Numerous modern theories of emotion concur that the fundamental distinguishing emotions are typically pleasure (joy), surprise, wrath, sorrow, and fear (McColl-Kennedy et al., 2019; Shaver, Morgan, & Wu, 1996). To quantify the emotional component of consumer behavior, however, a number of significant issues from this research appeared that needed to be solved (Keiningham et al., 2017). These issues included uncertainty about the nature and significance of emotions in influencing customer behavior (Bagozzi et al., 1999; Laros & Steenkamp, 2005). Past research has taken a variety of various stances when addressing consumer sentiment. Some individuals thought of them in terms of the benefits and drawbacks they possessed (Oliver, 1997; Oliver 2010). Others have combined emotion research to create comprehensive sets of emotions related to consumption (Richins, 1997; Ruth et al., 2002), while others have concentrated

on specific emotions, such as joy and surprise (Arnold et al., 2005; Finn, 2005), delight (Oliver et al., 1997), anger, rage, irritation, frustration, and annoyance (McColl-Kennedy et al., 2003), and regret (Tsiros & Mittal, 2000; Parasuraman et al., 2016; Bougie et al., 2003). The different perspectives on the nature and component of emotions lead to inconsistent attempts to measure how emotions affect customer experience. This is unquestionably applicable to the retail industry because interactions between customers and a retailer's brands, service personnel, and products can arouse strong emotions in them (Mattila & Enz, 2002), which in turn may have an impact on key customer outcomes like positive or negative word-of-mouth, loyalty or retention metrics (Schoefer & Diamantopoulos, 2008).

The Linkages to C-A-B

The C-A-B framework is a widely used theory for portraying attitude formation (Loh et al., 2022). According to Holbrook and Havlena (1982), the Cognitive-Affective-Behavioral (C-A-B) model describes how consumers make purchasing decisions. According to a theoretical point of view, the retail service sector measures service delivery across the actual phases of the customer experience (Wu et al., 2022), including cognitive, emotional, and behavioral responses. The relevant variables may be used to describe each phase of the customer experience. In addition, further analyses of the relevant literature demonstrate that the concept of CE is based on customers' cognitive, emotional (affective), and behavioral responses (Salmuni et al., 2020; Walter et al., 2010; Verhoef, et al., 2009; Mayer & Schwager, 2007; Edvardersson et al., 2005; LaSalle & Briton, 2003).

However, few attempts have been made to comprehend CE in terms of cognitive, emotional, and behavioral responses (Palmer, 2010). This literature search on the Attitude Model is motivated by the requirement to comprehend the CE phases. People's attitudes are molded by their experiences, and their attitudes might shift as they gain more experience (Loh et al., 2022). The way people think and act toward their surroundings is shaped by their attitudes. The explanation of consumer behavior in the context of service has benefited significantly from the concept of attitude (Usak et al., 2020; Ki & Hon, 2012; Kwun, 2011; Han & Kim, 2010; Grace & O'Cass, 2004;). In psychology, an attitude is described as a taught inclination to react consistently favorably or unfavorably towards a specific object (Ajzen & Fishbein, 1977; Wilkie, 1994). The first view of human behavior indicates that the attitude model consists of three components, namely cognitive, affective, and conative (behavior) (Jain, 2014). Each of these components is highly distinct from the others, and they can all contribute to the formation of people's attitudes and, consequently, their interactions with the outside world. In other words, the Cognitive represents a person's knowledge, views, thoughts (perceptions), or beliefs, the Affective component deals with overt emotions like dread or hatred, while the Conative component reflects a person's inclinations to act in a certain manner with respect to the attitude object. Ajzen and Fishbein (1975) argued cognitive, emotional, and behavioral components are frequently indistinguishable in empirical studies, and the three-component concept is unsuitable since it implies that the three kinds of responses are normally separate. Because all measures of attitudes (cognitive, emotional, and behavioral) arrange persons along an evaluative continuum, their study shows that only a unidimensional model of attitude is suitable (Ajzen & Fishbein 1975).

Several different conceptualizations of attitudes, particularly those found in the field of marketing, have asserted that attitudes are formed on the basis of cognitive, emotional, and behavioral factors (Eagly & Chaiken 1993; Ford & Smith 1987; Lutz, 1991). People construct beliefs, which have a cognitive component, in response to the information that is presented to them concerning the attitude object (Eagly & Chaiken 1993). Consumers engage in a wide array of information processing techniques and strategies on a daily basis in order to generate numerous opinions on a broad range of goods, products, and alternatives (Zinkhan & Braunsberger, 2004; Vannoy, 1965). The degree of complication in the cognitive structure of a customer is a significant factor in influence.

Affective components are based on how people feel (emotional experiences) or what they like (customer's preferences.) Positive (e.g., pleasure) and negative (e.g., rage) emotional effects on products can result from positive and negative experiences with the product or service features (Derbaix & Pham, 1991). Individuals with favorable affective responses to an experience with a product or service are more likely to view an attitude object favorably (satisfactorily), whereas those with negative affective reactions are less likely to evaluate the attitude object favorably (Eagly & Chaiken 1993; Oliver 1980, 1993; Westbrook 1987). According to Czepiel and Rosenberg (1977), customer satisfaction is an attitude since it is a measurable evaluative orientation. They argued that an attitude can only exist after real consumption or experience since it is made up of affective elements (such as joy, wrath, favor, and satisfaction) and is typically manifested in behavior. The behavioral component examines individuals' overt activities with respect to the attitude object. It is based on the acts that people display (Eagly & Chaiken 1993; MacKenzie & Lutz 1989). According to Bem (1970) and Eagly and Chaiken (1993), attitudes are drawn from behavior that has occurred in the past and is created by either direct or indirect experiences. People have a tendency to infer attitudes that are compatible with their previous acts, according to a self-perception explanation of how attitudes are formed.

The links between the three components were captured using the C-A-B framework, which was developed utilizing the aforementioned context. This theory, in particular, illustrates how cognition has a direct impact on affective response, which in turn affects behavior and serves as a motivator for someone to engage in a certain action. Numerous previous studies in various contexts have used the C-A-B framework as the underpinning theory (Loh et al., 2022). In the mobile context, for example, Kim et al. (2013) verified the links between user engagement incentives (conation), perceived value (cognition), and contentment (affection). On the other hand, Salmuni et al. (2020) through their study on the healthcare industry context validated a CE measurement model by taking into account relevant variables and depicting three stages of the customer journey. The variables are Service Personal Value, Service Value, and Service Quality (cognitive phase);

Emotional Satisfaction (affective phase); and Favorable Behavioral Intention (behavioral responses phase). In order to examine the impact of emotional intelligence on consumers' value perceptions and purchasing behaviors in the setting of e-commerce, Lim and Kim (2020) used the C-A-B as the overarching theory. Furthermore, Dai et al. (2020) used the C-A-B framework to investigate how perceived information overload (cognition) impacts social media users' information avoidance intention (conation) through fatigue, frustration, and dissatisfaction (affective). However, very few studies have used the C-A-B framework to particularly investigate the organic foods retailer context. In addition, a multi-dimensional C-A-B framework was developed to assess customers' intentions to purposefully repurchase the products and services they have purchased. A collection of perceptual attitudes that can recognize consumer decision-making and behavior must thus be provided by the C-A-B model (Gursoy et al., 2019). As a result, it is consistent with the goal of this study, which is to conceptualize the role played by customer experiences (CE) in the retail context for organic foods using the Cognitive-Affective-Behavior (C-A-B) paradigm.

METHODOLOGY

Using the perspective of the Cognitive-Affective-Behaviour (C-A-B) theory, this review paper attempts to conceptualize the role of customer experiences (CE) of retail organic foods. Therefore, the extensive literature review was performed to develop understanding on the three components of the C-A-B Theory in order to explain an individual's comprehensive evaluation of an object, which represents their personal cognitive, emotional, and behavioural responses. An electronic citation database was carried out using Scopus, Web of Science, Emerald Insight and Google Scholar to find relevant works that dealt with the subject matter of this study including customer purchase experiences towards organic foods, and their situations or conditions in cognitive, affective and behaviour setting. Next, the titles and abstracts of each article were reviewed to determine their applicability and relevancy. The use of keywords and their combinations (cognitive, affective, emotions, behaviour, The C-A-B Theory, customer experience, in-store experience, organic foods, retailer) improved this attempt by assisting in the search for pertinent studies. Utilizing this approach then, few selected papers that look at the customer experiences in retail setting and their adoption of cognitive, affective and behaviour situations were identified, chosen, and used for the review of the current study. Most of the studies were obtained from the Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics, Journal of Business Research, Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science, Journal of Service Research, International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health, Journal of Service Theory and Practice, Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services, and Journal of Services Marketing. In order to develop an understanding of the application and roots of the theory, older articles have also been discussed, while relevant research published between 2010 and 2020 was considered for this analysis in order to give an up-to-date and critical overview.

CONCLUSION

Using the C-A-B paradigm, this review paper attempts to conceptualize the underlying mechanism that drives customer experience in the setting of organic food retailers. An extensive and thorough analysis of the literature offers a more in-depth understanding of many customers' experience-related challenges in a systematic way. The evaluation underlines how customer experience is becoming a key idea for gaining a competitive edge. The notions of retail experience and customer experience are both positioned in the cognitive-affective elements drawing from the C-A-B Theory, and it becomes clear through an examination of various viewpoints and definitions of these terms. Apart from the definitions of customer experience, this review paper also discusses the method and phases, experience formation, and scale and measurement. The review of the literature reveals that there are gaps in the conception of the customer experience, both from a theoretical and a practical standpoint. Thus, it can be concluded that customer experience is found as a holistic notion that encompasses all of the attitudes, feelings, and impressions that are formed as a result of interaction at various phases of the consuming process. These experiences are then can be concluded as the sum of the customer's impressions of the service's delivery, the business itself, the environment, and their interactions with employees and other customers. These, in turn, induce the consumer's cognitive, emotional, and behavioural responses, which cement the experience in the consumer's mind.

IMPLICATIONS FOR MANAGEMENT

There are significant management implications from this study, which may include a call to action for green retailers to create strategies that foster favourable impressions of their brands in the minds of consumers. First, the findings imply that CE is an essential driver for retailers seeking to increase their customers' emotional and cognitive responses. Hence, this study emphasizes the significance of experiential marketing (Pine & Gilmore, 1998), which may be done by engaging various consumer senses and activating their cognitive, emotional, behavioural, and sensory experience. Retailers should focus on increasing consumers' emotional on consumer experience, as this has a significant impact on their subsequent affective brand loyalty (Khan et al., 2020). Based on the findings, managers should assess the psychological factors that influence customer satisfaction and repurchase intent, as well as design strategies to reduce negative customer experiences. Further, it is advisable that managers adopt relationship marketing techniques, such as enhanced communication and customer trust (Elsantil et al., 2021; Sharifi & Esfidani, 2013) in order to reduce cognitive dissonance and encourage favourable experiences.

Moreover, this review also implies that there are certain gaps in the conception of the customer experience, both from a theoretical and a business perspective. It emphasizes the lack of consensus and clarity on its concept, definitions, characterization, formation, and measurement, all of which have yet to be thoroughly investigated and validated. There are several research-related complexities that need to be further addressed by both academics and practitioners. Notwithstanding the substantial quantity of work that has been done on the subject of customer experience, it has not yet been clearly established and evolved as an academic field for management training and management application in business. A great number of studies point out how important it is to have methods that are accurate and valid for integrating, implementing, and measuring. More empirical research is required in order to establish a robust conceptualization of the customer experience, investigate the way in which it relates to other conceptual frameworks, and investigate how it might be generalized across a variety of settings.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The authors would like to extend their gratitude to the Graduate School of Business, Universiti Sains Malaysia (USM), Penang for funding the research.

REFERENCES

- Abbott. (1955). *Quality and Competition*. Columbia University Press, New York.
- Arnold, M. J., Reynolds, K. E., Ponder, N. & Lueg, J. E. (2005). Customer delight in a retail context: investigating delightful and terrible shopping experiences. *Journal of Business Research*, Vol. 58, No. 8, pp. 1132-1145.
- Ajzen, I. (1991). The theory of planned behaviour. *Organizational Behaviour and Human Decision Processes*, Vol. 50, No. 2, pp. 179–211.
- Ajzen, I., & Fishbein, M. (1975). *Belief, Attitude, Intention and Behavior: An Introduction to Theory and Research*. Reading, MA-Addison-Wesley.
- Ajzen, I., & Fishbein, M. (1977). Attitude-behavior relations: A theoretical analysis and review of empirical research. *Psychological Bulletin*, 84(5), 888–918. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0033-2909.84.5.888>
- Bagozzi, R.P., Gopinath, M. & Nyer, P.U. (1999). The role of emotions in marketing. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, Vol. 27 No. 2, pp. 184-206.
- Bascur, C., & Rusu, C. (2020). Customer experience in retail: A systematic literature review. *Applied Sciences (Switzerland)*, 10(21), 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.3390/app10217644>
- Bagozzi, R.P., Gopinath, M. & Nyer, P.U. (1999). The role of emotions in marketing. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, Vol. 27 No. 2, pp. 184-206.
- Baxendale, Shane, Emma K. Macdonald, & Hugh N. Wilson. (2015). The Impact of Different Touchpoints on Brand Consideration. *Journal of Retailing*, 91(2), 235-253.
- Bem, D. J. (1970). *Beliefs, Attitudes, and Human Affairs*, Belmont, CA: Brooks/Cole.
- Berry, Leonard L., Carbone, Lewis P. & Haeckel, Stephan H. (2002). Managing the total customer experience. *Sloan Management review*. 43 (Spring) (p.85-9).
- Bougie, R., Pieters, R. & Zeelenberg, M. (2003). Angry customers don't come back: they get back: the experience and behavioural implications of anger and dissatisfaction in services. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, Vol. 31 No. 4, pp. 377-393.
- Brakus, J.J., Schmitt, B.H., Zarantonello, L. (2009). Brand experience: what is it? How is it measured? Does it affect loyalty? *J. Market.* 73 (3), 52–68.
- Bustamante, J. C., & Rubio, N. (2017). Measuring customer experience in physical retail environments. *Journal of Service Management*, 28(5), 884–913. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JOSM-06-2016-0142>.
- Chatzoglou, P., Chatzoudes, D., Savvidou, A., Fotiadis, T., & Delias, P. (2022). Factors affecting repurchase intentions in retail shopping: An empirical study. *Heliyon*, 8(9). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2022.e10619>
- Cheng, T. L., Mun, Y. W., Nair, M. N. N., & Chuan, S. B. (2020). To buy or not to buy? Consumers' attitudes and purchase behaviour for organic food in Malaysia. In *Jurnal Pengurusan (Vol. 60)*. Penerbit Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia. <https://doi.org/10.17576/pengurusan-2020-60-01>
- Cronin, J. J., & Taylor, S. A. (1992). Measuring quality: a re-examination and extension. *Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 56, No. 3, pp. 55–68, 1992.
- Czepiel, J. A., & L. J. Rosenberg (1977). The Study of Consumer Satisfaction: Assessing the “So What” Question.” In *Conceptualizations and Measurement of Consumer Satisfaction and Dissatisfaction (Report No. 77-103)*, edited by K. H. Hunt. Cambridge, MA: Marketing Science Institute.
- Da Silva, R.V. & Syed, S.F. (2006). Cognitive, affective attributes and conative, behavioural responses in retail corporate branding. *Journal of Product and Brand Management*, Vol. 15 No. 5, pp. 293-305.
- Dai, B., Ali, A. and Wang, H. (2020). Exploring information avoidance intention of social media users: A cognition–affect–conation perspective. *Internet Research*, Vol. 30, No. 5, pp. 1455-1478.
- De Keyser, A., Katherine N. L., Timothy, K. & Philipp, K. (2015). *A Framework for Understanding and Managing the Customer Experience. MSI Working Paper Series (15-121)*. Cambridge, MA: Marketing Science Institute.

- Derbaix, C., & Pham, M. T. (1991). Affective reactions to consumption situations: A pilot investigation. *Journal of Economic Psychology*, 12(2), 325–355. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0167-4870\(91\)90019-P](https://doi.org/10.1016/0167-4870(91)90019-P).
- Department of Agriculture Malaysia (DOAM). (2019). Department of agriculture strategic plan 2016–2020. Retrieved from; http://www.doa.gov.my/index/resources/aktiviti_sumber/sumber_awam/penerbitan/pelan_strategik_doa_2016_2020.pdf
- Eagly, A. H., & Chaiken, S. (1993). *The Psychology of Attitudes*. Orlando, FL: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.
- Edvardsson, B., Enquist, B., & Johnston, R. (2005). Cocreating customer value through hyperreality in the pre-purchase service experience. *Journal of Service Research*, Vol. 8, No. 2, pp. 149–161.
- Elsantil, Y., Elsantil, Y. G., Moustafa, A. A., & Hamza, E. G. A. (2021). Article ID: IJM_12_01_021 Negative Purchase Experiences: Model and Future Directions. *International Journal of Management (IJM)*, 12(1), 254–266. <https://doi.org/10.34218/IJM.12.1.2021.021>
- Finn, A. (2005). Reassessing the foundations of customer delight. *Journal of Service Research*, Vol. 8 No. 2, pp. 103–116.
- Ford, G. T. & Ruth A. S. (1987). Inferential Beliefs in Consumer Evaluations: An Assessment of Alternative Processing Strategies. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 14, 363–371.
- Garbarino, E.C. & Edell, J.A. (1997). Cognitive effort, affect, and choice. *Journal of Consumer Research*, Vol. 24 No. 3, pp. 147–158.
- Garg, R., Rahman, Z., & Qureshi, M. N. (2014). Measuring customer experience in banks: scale development and validation. *Journal of Modelling in Management*, 9(1), 87–117. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JM2-07-2012-0023>
- Gentile, C., Spiller, N. & Noci, G. (2007). How to sustain the customer experience: An overview of experience components that co-create value with the customer. *European Management Journal*, Vol. 25 No. 5, pp. 395–410.
- Goode, M., Dahl, D. & Moreau, P. (2010). The effect of experiential analogies on consumer perceptions and attitudes. *Journal Marketing Research*, Vol. 47 No. 2, pp. 274–286
- Grace, D., & O’Cass, A. (2004). Examining service experiences and post-consumption evaluations. *Journal of Services Marketing*, Vol. 18, No. 6, pp. 450–461.
- Grönroos, C. (1984). A service quality model and its marketing implications. *European Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 18, No. 4, pp. 36–44.
- Grundey, D. (2008). Editorial applying sustainability principles in the economy. *Baltic Journal on Sustainability*, Vol. 14 No. 2, pp. 101–106.
- Gursoy, D., Chi, O.H., Lu, L. & Nunkoo, R. (2019). Consumers acceptance of artificially intelligent (AI) device use in service delivery. *International Journal of Information Management*, Vol. 49, pp. 157–169
- Han, H., & Kim, Y. (2010). An investigation of green hotel customers’ decision formation: Developing an extended model of the theory of planned behavior. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 29, No. 4, pp. 659–668.
- Holbrook, M.B., & Hirschman, E.C. (1982). The experiential aspects of consumption: Consumer fantasies, feelings, and fun. *Journal of Consumer Research*, Volume 9, Issue 2, pp. 132–140.
- Homburg, C., Schemmle, M., & Kuehnl, C. (2015). New product design: Concept, measurement, and consequences. *Journal of Market*, 79(3), 41–56.
- Izard, C.E. (1977). *Human Emotions*, Plenum Press, New York, NY.
- Jaafar, F. (2021). The Malaysian Reserve. Malaysia’s retail sectors hit hard by the COVID-19 pandemic. Retrieved from; <https://themalaysianreserve.com/2021/12/08/malaysias-retail-sectors-hit-hard-by-the-covid-19-pandemic/>
- Jain, V. (2014). 3D Model of Attitude. *International Journal of Advanced Research in Management and Social Sciences*. <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/265567380>
- Jain, R., Aagja, J., & Bagdare, S. (2017). Customer experience – a review and research agenda. In *Journal of Service Theory and Practice*, Vol. 27, Issue 3, pp. 642–662. Emerald Group Publishing Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JSTP-03-2015-0064>
- Jeong, E. and Jang, S. (2011). Restaurant experiences trigger positive electronic word-of-mouth (eWOM) motivations. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 30 No. 2, pp. 356–366
- Kashif, M., Samsi, S. Z. M., Awang, Z., & Mohamad, M. (2016). EXQ: measurement of healthcare experience quality in Malaysian settings – A contextualist perspective. *International Journal of Pharmaceutical and Healthcare Marketing*, Vol. 10 (1).
- Kempf, D.S. (1999). Attitude formation from product trial: distinct roles of cognition and affect for hedonic and functional products. *Psychology & Marketing*, Vol. 16 No. 1, pp. 35–50.
- Keiningham, T., Ball, J., Benoit (née Moeller), S., Bruce, H. L., Buoye, A., Dzenkovska, J., Nasr, L., Ou, Y. C., & Zaki, M. (2017). The interplay of customer experience and commitment. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 31(2), 148–160. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JSM-09-2016-0337>
- Khan, I., Hollebeek, L. D., Fatma, M., Islam, J. U., & Riiivits-Arkonsuo, I. (2020). Customer experience and commitment in retailing: Does customer age matter? *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 57. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jretconser.2020.102219>.

- Ki, E. J., & Hon, L. C. (2012). Causal linkages among relationship quality perception, attitude, and behaviour intention in a membership organization. *Corporate Communications: An International Journal*, Vol. 17, No. 2, pp. 187–208.
- Kim, Y.H., Kim, D.J. and Wachter, K. (2013). A study of mobile user engagement (MoEN): Engagement motivations, perceived value, satisfaction, and continued engagement intention. *Decision Support Systems*, Vol. 56, pp. 361–370.
- Kusumawati, A., & Rahayu, K. S. (2020). The effect of experience quality on customer perceived value and customer satisfaction and its impact on customer loyalty. *TQM Journal*, 32(6), 1525–1540. <https://doi.org/10.1108/TQM-05-2019-0150>.
- Kwun, D. J. W. (2011). Effects of campus foodservice attribute on perceived value, satisfaction, and consumer attitude: A gender-difference approach. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 30, No. 2, pp. 252–261.
- Laros, F.J. & Steenkamp, J.B.E. (2005). Emotions in consumer behaviour: a hierarchical approach. *Journal of Business Research*, Vol. 58 No. 10, pp. 1437-1445.
- LaSalle, D., & Britton, T. A. (2003). Priceless: Turning Ordinary Products into Extraordinary experiences. Boston: Harvard Business School Press.
- Lazarus, R.S. (1982). Thoughts on the relations between emotion and cognition. *American Psychologist*, Vol. 37 No. 9, pp. 1019-1024.
- Lemon, K. N., & Verhoef, P. C. (2016). Understanding customer experience throughout the customer journey. *Journal of Market*, 80(6), 69-96.
- Lim, S. H. & Kim, D. J. (2020). Does emotional intelligence of online shoppers affect their shopping behavior? From a Cognitive-Affective-Conative Framework Perspective. *International Journal of Human-Computer Interact.*, Vol. 36, no. 14, pp. 1304–1313. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1080/10447318.2020.1739882>.
- Loh, X. M., Lee, V. H., Hew, T. S., & Lin, B. (2022). The cognitive-affective nexus on mobile payment continuance intention during the COVID-19 pandemic. *International Journal of Bank Marketing*, 40(5), 939–959. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJBM-06-2021-0257>
- Lutz, R. J. (1991). The Role of Attitude Theory in Marketing, in *Perspectives in Consumer Behaviour*, 4th edition, Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall International Editions.
- Mattila, A.S. & Enz, C.A. (2002). The role of emotions in service encounters. *Journal of Service Research*, Vol. 4(4), pp. 268-277.
- Meyer, C., & Schwager, A. (2007). Understanding customer experience. *Harvard Business Review*, pp. 1–11.
- McCull-Kennedy, J. R., Zaki, M., Lemon, K. N., Urmetzer, F., & Neely, A. (2019). Gaining Customer Experience Insights That Matter. *Journal of Service Research*, 22(1), 8–26. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1094670518812182>
- McCull-Kennedy, J.R., Daus, C.S. & Sparks, B.A. (2003). The role of gender in reactions to service failure and recovery. *Journal of Service Research*, Vol. 6(1), pp. 66-82.
- McCrae, R. (1987). Creativity, divergent thinking, and openness to experience. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, Vol. 52 No. 6, pp. 1258-1265.
- Mouri, N., Bindroo, V., & Ganesh, J. (2015). Do retail alliances enhance customer experience? Examining the relationship between alliance value and customer satisfaction with the alliance. *Journal of Marketing Management*, 31(11–12), 1231–1254. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0267257X.2015.1011195>.
- Nathan, R. J., Soekmawati, Victor, V., Popp, J., Fekete-Farkas, M., & Oláh, J. (2021). Food innovation adoption and organic food consumerism-a cross national study between Malaysia and Hungary. *Foods*, 10(2), 1–21. <https://doi.org/10.3390/foods10020363>
- Oliver, R. L. (1980). A Cognitive Model of the Antecedents and Consequences of Satisfaction Decision. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 17 (4): 460-69.
- Oliver, R.L., Rust, R.T. & Varki, S. (1997). Customer delight: Foundations, findings, and managerial insight. *Journal of Retailing*, Vol. 73 No. 3, pp. 311-336.
- Oliver, R.L. (1997). *Satisfaction: A Behavioural Perspective on the Customer*, McGraw-Hill, New York, NY.
- Oliver, R.L. (2010), *Satisfaction: A Behavioural Perspective on the Consumer*, 2nd ed., M. E. Sharpe, Armonk, NY.
- Palmer, A. (2010). Customer experience management: a critical review of an emerging idea. *Journal of Services Marketing*, Vol. 24, No. 3, pp. 196–208.
- Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V. A., & Berry, L. L. (1985). A conceptual model of service quality and its implications for future research. *Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 49, No. Fall 1985, pp. 41–50.
- Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V. A., Berry, L. L. (1988). SERVQUAL: A multiple-item scale for measuring consumer perceptions of service quality. *Journal of Retailing*, Vol. 64, No. 1, pp. 12–40.
- Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V. A., Berry, L. L. (1991). Refinement and reassessment of the SERVQUAL scale. *Journal of Retailing*, Vol. 4, No. Winter 1991, pp. 420–450.
- Pine, B.J., Gilmore, J.H. (1998). Welcome to the experience economy. *Harv. Bus. Rev.* 76, 97–105.
- Parasuraman, A.P., Ball, J., Aksoy, L. & Keiningham, T.L. (2016). From practicality to paradox: examining the customer experience of delight. Working Paper, University of Miami.
- Plutchik, R. (1980). *Emotion: A Psycho evolutionary Synthesis*, Harper & Row, New York, NY.
- Poullsson, S.H. & Kale, S.H. (2004). The experience economy and commercial experiences. *The Marketing Review*, Vol. 4 No. 3, pp. 267-278.

- Richins, M.L. (1997). Measuring emotions in the consumption experience. *Journal of Consumer Research*, Vol. 24 No. 2, pp. 127-146.
- Ruth, J.A., Brunel, F.F. & Otnes, C.C. (2002). Linking thoughts to feelings: investigating cognitive appraisals and consumption emotions in a mixed-emotions context. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, Vol. 30 No. 1, pp. 44-58.
- Salmuni, W., Mustaffa, W., Rahman, R. A., Wahid, H. A., & Ahmad, N. L. (2020). A Cognitive-Affective-Behavioural Responses of Customer Experience (CAB-CE) Model for Service Delivery Improvement in the Healthcare Industry. <http://excelingtech.co.uk/>
- Schmitt, B. H. (1999). *Experiential Marketing: How to Get Customers to Sense, Feel, Think, Act and Relate to Your Company and Brands*. Free Press, New York.
- Schoefer, K. & Diamantopoulos, A. (2008). The role of emotions in translating perceptions of (in) justice into post complaint behavioural responses. *Journal of Service Research*, Vol. 11 No. 1, pp. 91-103.
- Sharifi, S. S., & Esfidani, M. R. (2013). The impacts of relationship marketing on cognitive dissonance, satisfaction, and loyalty: The mediating role of trust and cognitive dissonance. *International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management*, 42(6), 553-575.
- Shaver, Phillip, Judith Schwartz, Donald Kirson, & Cary O'Connor. (1987). Emotion Knowledge: Further Exploration of a Prototype Approach. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 52(6),1061-1086.
- Shaver, P. R., Morgan, H. J. & Wu Shelley (1996). Is Love a Basic Emotion? *Personal Relationships*, 3 (1996), 81-96.
- Suhaimee, S., Ibrahim, I.Z. & Abd Wahab, M.A.M. (2016). Organic agriculture in Malaysia. FFTC Agricultural Policy.
- Sweeney, J.C. and Soutar, G. (2001). Consumer perceived value: the development of a multiple item scale. *Journal of Retailing*, Vol. 77 No. 2, pp. 203-220. Customer perceived value and satisfaction.
- Terblanche, N. S. (2018). Revisiting the supermarket in-store customer shopping experience. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 40, 48–59. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jretconser.2017.09.004>
- The American Psychological Association. (2016). Glossary of psychological terms. Retrieved at: www.apa.org/research/action/glossary.aspx.
- Tsiros, M. & Mittal, V. (2000). Regret: a model of its antecedents and consequences in consumer decision making. *Journal of Consumer Research*, Vol. 26 No. 4, pp. 401-417.
- Usak, M., Kubiak, M., Shabbir, M. S., Viktorovna Dudnik, O., Jermittiparsert, K., & Rajabion, L. (2020). Health care service delivery based on the Internet of things: A systematic and comprehensive study. *International Journal of Communication Systems*, Vol. 33, No. 2, pp. 4179.
- Vannoy, J. S. (1965). Generality of cognitive complexity–simplicity as a personality construct. *J Pers Social Psychology*, Vol. 2(3):385–96.
- Verhoef, P. C., Lemon, K. N., Parasuraman, A., Roggeveen, A., Tsiros, M., & Schlesinger, L. A. (2009). Customer experience creation: Determinants, dynamics, and management strategies. *Journal of Retailing*, Vol. 85, No. 1, pp. 31–41.
- Verhoef, P. C., Kooge, Edwin & Walk, N. (2016). *Creating Value with Big Data Analytics: Making Smarter Marketing Decisions*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Verhoef, P. C., Katherine N. L., Parasuraman, A., Rog-geveen, A, Tsiros, M. & Schlesinger, L. A. (2009). Customer Experience Creation: Determinants, Dynamics, and Management Strategies. *Journal of Retailing*, 85(1), 31-41.
- Walter, U., Edvardsson, B., & Öström, Å. (2010). Drivers of customers' service experiences: A study in the restaurant industry. *Managing Service Quality*, Vol. 20, No. 3, pp. 236–258.
- Westbrook, R. A. (1987). Product/Consumption-Based Affective Responses and Post-Purchase Processes. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 24 (3): 258-70.
- Wilkie, W. L. (1991). *Consumer Behaviour* (3rd eds.). United States of America: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Woodward, M.N. & Holbrook, M.B. (2013). Dialogue on some concepts, definitions, and issues pertaining to 'consumption experiences. *Marketing Theory*, Vol. 13, No. 3, pp. 1-22.
- Wu, H. C., Ai, C. H., Chang, Y. Y., Wang, D. Q., & Wu, T. P. (2022). Experiential quality, experiential relationship quality, and future experiential intentions in the Macau gaming industry. *Tourism Review*, 77(1), 177–189. <https://doi.org/10.1108/TR-04-2020-0180>
- Yang, X., Mao, H., & Peracchio, L. A. (2012). It's Not Whether You Win or Lose, it's how you Play the Game? The Role of Process and Outcome in Experience Consumption. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 49(6), 954–966. <https://doi.org/10.1509/jmr.10.0083>
- Zinkhan, G. M., & Braunsberger, K. (2004). The complexity of consumers' cognitive structures and its relevance to consumer behaviour. *Journal of Business Research*, 57(6), 575–582. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0148-2963\(02\)00396-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0148-2963(02)00396-X).

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

The author(s), as noted, certify that they have NO affiliations with or involvement in any organisation or agency with any financial interest (such as honoraria; educational grants; participation in speakers' bureaus; membership, jobs, consultancies, stock ownership, or other equity interest; and expert testimony or patent-licensing arrangements), or non-

financial interest (such as personal or professional relationships, affiliations, expertise or beliefs) in the subject matter or materials addressed in this manuscript.

AUTHORS' BIOGRAPHY



Author's Full Name: Harniyati Hussin

Author's Email: harniyati.work@gmail.com

Author Professional Bio: Harniyati Hussin is a Ph.D. candidate at the Graduate School of Business, Universiti Sains Malaysia (USM), Penang. Her teaching and research areas include green marketing, entrepreneurship, information technology in business, and consumer behavior.



Author's Full Name: Nabsiah Abdul Wahid

Author's Email: nabsiah@usm.my

Author Professional Bio: Nabsiah Abdul Whid is a Professor of Marketing at the Graduate School of Business, Universiti Sains Malaysia (USM), Penang, and has been teaching for more than 25 years at the university. She has also completed several research grants and writes articles related to services marketing, business, consumer behavior, halal tourism, social science, services, green marketing, environmental education, and water, and energy. She can be contacted at nabsiah@usm.my.